



Planning and Transportation Committee

Date: TUESDAY, 9 OCTOBER 2012
Time: 11.00 am
Venue: LIVERY HALL - WEST WING, GUILDHALL

10. **ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS URGENT**
- A) **Resolution from the Barbican Residential Committee**
 - B) **Moorgate Escalators**

John Barradell
Town Clerk and Chief Executive

This page is intentionally left blank

Agenda Item 10

Item No. 10

TO: **PLANNING AND TRANSPORTATION
COMMITTEE**

Tuesday, 9 October 2012

FROM: **BARBICAN RESIDENTIAL COMMITTEE**

Monday, 24 September
2012

BARBICAN RESIDENTIAL COMMITTEE - UPDATE REPORT

Following comments made at the Barbican Residents' Consultation Committee on 10 September 2012, the Chairman had agreed to receive a presentation from the Assistant Director (Environmental Enhancement), as part of this item.

The presentation on the Street Scene covered the following:

- Seating on the Highwalks/St Giles' Terrace
- Lighting and security
- Silk Street/Beech Street junction – new zebra crossings and removal of the traffic island
- The widened footway outside the cinema
- Options for the tunnel improvements
- Availability and use of Section 106 funding

Members felt concerned about Beech Street and the Barbican Centre Board had repeatedly expressed its dissatisfaction about the area's poor appearance, particularly in the context of the cultural quarter. The Assistant Director confirmed that funding was an issue due to changes to EU legislation, following the tunnel fire in Switzerland last year. The Assistant Director was fully aware of the Art Centre's concerns and met regularly with the Managing Director and his team.

In response to further questions, the Assistant Director advised that:

- In the existing strategy, London Wall would retain 4 lanes of traffic and any proposed reduction would be through lane width reduction. The removal of whole lanes would need to part of a major study on traffic impact.
- All designs for Beech Street Tunnel would be vandal proof, as far as possible and that in order to widen footways it may be possible to remove the central reservation from the tunnel, as has been proposed at the eastern end of the street by the new cinemas.

It was moved by JEREMY MAYHEW, Seconded by DEPUTY JOYCE NASH and RESOLVED, that:

The Planning and Transportation Committee be asked to consider improvements to Beech Street Tunnel as a matter of priority, given its significance within the Cultural Quarter.

This page is intentionally left blank

Committee(s):	Date(s):
Planning and Transportation	9 October 2012
Subject: Moorgate Escalators (2 No.)	Public
Report of: City Surveyor CS 387/12	For Decision
Ward (if appropriate): Coleman Street	

Summary

The 2 escalators at Moorgate connecting to the Barbican High Walk failed an Allianz Insurance Inspectors Report on 6 September 2012 due to damaged parts causing a significant safety risk for example worn out tread pallets, combe plates, broken 'teeth', and a number of worn out mechanical parts. As a result these escalators have had to be taken temporarily out of service and remain so with only a staircase open for use.

Due to their specific design and age of 39 years, there is a lack of available spares and some will need to be specially manufactured. Therefore despite efforts to source spares our maintenance supplier Apex Lifts are not currently in a position to quickly reinstate the service of both escalators in advance of their full replacement by Crossrail.

There is no easy option both in time and cost however, officers have been urgently exploring a number of options and in particular if it is possible to use the parts of the down escalator to repair the up escalator in order to provide an up escalator service only and rely on the fixed staircase to go down. This option is feasible and provides the most economic and quickest solution to the reinstatement of service and will meet the requirements of our insurers. I anticipate that the estimated expenditure of £25,000 plus staff costs of £1,500 for this Option can be contained within my Local Risk Budget, and upon approval the works are estimated to take 3-5 weeks approximately to complete. Crossrail are programmed to install 2 new escalators in November 2014.

Recommendations

I recommend:

- That your Committee considers this report and approves Option 4 – Single Refurbishment of one escalator to provide an up only escalator service with a fixed staircase down until the two new escalators are installed by Crossrail.

Main Report

Background

1. On behalf of the City of London Corporation I have under my responsibility some 250 lifts, escalators and cradles in Operational and Investment Properties. These include the management and maintenance of the 14 public lifts and escalators which fall within the remit of the Planning and Transportation Committee.
2. These installations vary in type, age, quality and manufacturer. Each is subject to a maintenance and service contract with Apex Lifts. They are all subject to regular service and insurance inspections and any necessary works identified are carried out.
3. By nature of their location external escalators and lifts are sometimes subject to a more arduous environment than the general lift stock, e.g. extremes of weather, graffiti, unwanted abuse, etc.

Current Position

4. At each of the Planning and Transportation Committees I report on the service performance of the public lifts and escalators.
5. The 2 escalators at Moorgate were constructed in 1973 and are due to be replaced by new escalators as part of the Crossrail scheme. Unfortunately, due to safety concerns both escalators failed an Allianz Insurance Inspectors Report, which listed a number of mechanical and safety defects, damaged tread pallets, combe plates, broken teeth, faulty brakes, worn step rollers and worn chains. As a result these escalators have had to be taken temporarily out of service. Due to their design and age, 39 years, there is a lack of available spares and therefore, we are not currently in a position to reinstate the service. Subsequently my Engineer has met with the insurance inspector and our term contractor (Apex) lift engineer to discuss the options both short and medium term to enable the City to restore service. There is no easy option both in time and cost, and bearing mind the on-going Crossrail works at Moorgate, whose programme is expected to install new escalators November 2014 in a nearby location.

Options

6. Option 1 – Leave both escalators out of service with only a staircase in use and await the installation of new escalators by the Crossrail Project in 2014.

Issues:

- i) Operationally not a preferred option as these escalators are regularly and well used by the public and access to the Highwalk.
 - ii) This would also incur costs for permanent hoarding-off the escalators estimated at approximately £10,000.
 - iii) Access to Barbican High Walk will be via single fixed stair only until the replacement by Crossrail in late 2014.
7. Option 2 – Complete refurbishment of both escalators; source and/or manufacture bespoke parts, if practicable, to reinstate both escalators, estimated cost approximately £100,000, programme estimated 6-9 months.

Issues:-

- i) Provides limited period of full service pre Crossrail installation of new escalators.
 - ii) Time out of service approximately 6-9 months whilst works are carried out.
 - iii) Temporary closure of escalator hall minimum estimated 5-6 months, no access via single fixed stair to Barbican Highwalk.
 - iv) Disruption to residents and local businesses including those on the Barbican Highwalk (e.g. City Boot Wine Bar)
 - v) Approval for additional funding of £75,000 will be required.
8. Option 3 – New Installation; replace both escalators with new, estimated cost £160,000. Programme estimated to be 6-9 months.

Issues:

- i) Provides limited service pre Crossrail installation of new escalators nearby and would not represent best value for money.
- ii) Time out of service minimum 6-9 months due to design, procure, lead-in and manufacture and installation time.
- iii) Temporary closure of escalator hall minimum 5-6 months no access to Barbican High Walk.
- iv) Disruption to residents and local businesses (e.g. City Boot Wine Bar)
- v) Approval for additional funding of £135,000 will be required.

- vi) Accessibility to physically install new escalators with Crossrail's programmed work will need to be investigated
9. Option 4 (Preferred Option) – Single Refurbishment of one escalator to provide an up only escalator service. Utilise the down escalator to retrieve necessary parts in order to reinstate the up escalator at an estimated cost of £25,000 plus staff costs of £1,500, programme 3-5 weeks.
10. I anticipate that this expenditure can be contained within my Local Risk Budget.

Issues:

- i) Loss of down escalator service until replacement by Crossrail (stairs only).
- ii) Future source of spare parts to maintain up service for next 18-24 months. This Option provides a readily available source of spare parts.
- iii) Programme 3-5 weeks from date of order.
- iv) Minimum disruption to residents and local businesses.

Proposals

11. Option 4 is preferred and the recommendation. Considering all the external issues, costs and programming, Option 4 is the best short term solution to reinstate a limited service and would represent best value for money.

Corporate & Strategic Implications

12. The proposals contained within this report relate to the Community Strategy in the following ways:-
- Good Transport for a Thriving City – *to improve the “pedestrian experience”*
 - An Inclusive and Outward Looking city – *enhancing accessibility.*

Officers have requested Crossrail to explore the possibility that they bring forward their installation of the new escalators from November 2014 and this is being considered. Further to consider making a contribution towards the refurbishment repair costs of proposed Option 4. Officers are awaiting confirmation of these requests. Current Crossrail plans indicate the new location

of the replacement escalators is nearby, but not within the same position of the existing escalators.

Impact Assessment

13. An Impact Assessment has been carried out and due to the close proximity of the Moor House Lift there is a neutral impact.

Public Information

14. Officers will ensure that Ward Members, Residents and Local Businesses are kept informed and up dated throughout the programme.

Financial

15. Option 4 – with the single refurbishment of one escalator to provide an up only escalator service and adjoining down staircase I anticipate that the estimated expenditure of £25,000 can be contained within my existing repairs and maintenance budget.
16. For the more expensive options, then additional funding will need to be sought through the City’s Project Approval Procedure.

Legal

17. The escalators and stairs are held by the City under a lease granted in 1976 for 125 years, on terms that the City be responsible for their maintenance. The stairs are declared City Walkway, but the escalators are shown on the City’s Highways Map as being “permissive path”. Given the mechanical nature of the escalator route and the inevitable need for this to be closed from time to time for maintenance and repair it is not considered that the escalators are subject to public rights of way or other specific duties to retain access. As regards the provision of replacement escalators and stairs by Crossrail this assurance is secured via Assurance 0085 given to Parliament during the passage of the Bill in December 2005 (as modified in January 2012).

Conclusion

18. Considering the lengthy timescales and additional costs that will be required, inconvenience for pedestrians and local businesses for any Option other than Option 4, this Option provides the best solution in advance of the new escalators to be constructed by the Crossrail Project in November 2014.

Background Papers:

None

Appendices

None

Contact:

George Stilgoe | george.stilgoe@cityoflondon.gov.uk | 020 7332 1459